

---

Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Noah Lewin-Epstein

Source: *The American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 90, No. 4 (Jan., 1985), pp. 930-932

Published by: [The University of Chicago Press](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2779536>

Accessed: 15/11/2010 06:47

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=ucpress>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*The University of Chicago Press* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The American Journal of Sociology*.

scholars in many fields: urban politics, political sociology, political economy, stratification, development and developing nations, policy research, the sociology of poverty and social welfare, and so on. Its readable style and the marked similarities between American and Italian urban problems will make it accessible to undergraduates and to the general public. Journalists writing on urban politics, reform movements, and organized crime would learn from it, and it is must reading for political reformers themselves. My only hesitation in recommending it to a general readership is that it may reinforce stereotypes about Italy as a nation of *mafiosi* and *miseria*, certainly not valid images of the North.

Chubb skillfully uses ethnographic methods, interview material, and descriptive statistics from a variety of sources; the data are presented clearly and are well integrated with the analysis. She also appropriately uses journalistic and anecdotal material, such as in the chapter on mafia involvement in local enterprises. The volume is attractively edited and illustrated.

*Patronage, Power, and Poverty in Southern Italy* is an extraordinarily important analysis for social scientists and practitioners and may well become a classic case study of power.

*Educating for Unemployment: Politics, Labor Markets, and the School System—Italy, 1859–1973.* By Marzio Barbagli. Translated by Robert Ross. New York: Columbia University Press, 1982. Pp. xviii + 414. \$35.00.

Noah Lewin-Epstein  
*Tel-Aviv University*

In a long-neglected book titled *The Evolution of Educational Thought*, Émile Durkheim argues that in order to understand the dynamics of institutional change in education, schools must be considered principally as powerful weapons in the hands of social groups that seek to maintain a dominant position in society. He cautions, however, that the educational system is not simply an adjunct of more decisive social processes. Rather, it is a relatively autonomous element much affected by internal forces. These dialectic propositions of political dominance and organizational autonomy provide an attractive framework for the study of change in national systems of schooling. Indeed, the contribution of *Educating for Unemployment* by Marzio Barbagli should be viewed in this context. It contains a wealth of information and a variety of stimulating ideas. More important, it revives Durkheim's model of the evolution of educational systems.

*Educating for Unemployment* is a historical study of Italy's educational development in its social context. The central phenomenon which the book addresses is the persistence of intellectual unemployment—"the

abundance of doctors without patients, lawyers without cases, engineers without bridges"—during changing economic circumstances and under a variety of political regimes. Among industrial nations Italy is the historical example par excellence of long-run disequilibrium of the educational and economic systems. The presence, at the turn of the century, of a relatively large middle class in the midst of economic underdevelopment was responsible, says Barbagli, for disproportionately high university enrollments alongside the highest illiteracy rates of industrializing nations. But he is quick to reject the technical-economic explanation of educational change which is based on the concept of development. "The growth and the stagnation of education may have been due not only and not so much to the rise and fall of the demand for technical qualification provided by the economy . . . but rather to the power relations among various social groups and to the struggles that these have conducted in order to maintain or improve their own positions in the system of social stratification" (p. 4).

The focus, then, is shifted from the economic to the political arena. With skill and impressive mastery of historical detail, Barbagli guides the reader through the transformation of the educational system in Italy, starting with the implementation in 1859 of the Casati Law, which both consolidated power in a central national bureaucracy and concentrated resources on higher education and secondary classical instruction. Subsequently the author reviews economic conditions, educational policies, and unemployment during the early 20th century; and the Fascist regime and the post-World War II period leading to the reforms of the late 1960s.

The scope of the data compiled is impressive. Many of the figures were collected from bureaus of statistics and appear here in organized form for the first time. In this respect the book will be of great value to students of education in contemporary Italy. As to general theoretical issues, *Educating for Unemployment* leaves much to be desired. Barbagli chooses as his null hypothesis the technical-functional interpretation of persistence and change in the educational system. He rejects it as inadequate. But such a conclusion is hardly shocking following the works of Spring, Archer, Collins, and even Durkheim, none of which are mentioned by the author. An alternative theoretical model is not fully formulated, although Barbagli argues convincingly that such a model must focus on the specific interests of national elites and other social groups.

The discussion of the Fascist period is most illuminating in this respect. The author illustrates the translation of the dominant elite's interests into an educational policy. The Fascist period, however, also provides an important test of the proposition that schooling is organized as a relatively autonomous structure. In one of his more insightful analyses, Barbagli shows that even under dictatorial rule educational institutions expanded and developed along "undesired" lines; more important, social processes stemming from family aspirations were stronger than bureaucratic decisions.

But this theoretical proposition is not pursued in a consistent way. For instance, in chapter 5 Barbagli concludes that the ability to persuade the masses to send their children to school "for authentic, actual learning," which could not be converted as a resource for mobility, was quite limited. Yet, when discussing efforts of corporate groups to better their market position, the author interprets their attempts to increase the demand for their services rather than trying to limit the supply of professionals as merely a preference for immediate results. The equally likely explanation, that such groups could hardly have an impact on the structure of education, is not considered.

Similarly, when interpreting the unexpectedly small increase of graduates in manufacturing during the 1960s (table 8.18), Barbagli suggests that it is due to the "stagnation of economic activity which affects the educated." This contradicts his central argument and his earlier findings concerning the expansion of job opportunities (especially in local government and services) in response to the growing supply of intellectuals.

In conclusion, I cannot help noting the gap between the comprehensive, illuminating treatment of central issues in Italian education and the failure to draw broad, theoretical implications. This is highlighted by the lack of a concluding chapter which could rise above the historical detail, systematize the major processes, and present the central conclusions.

Nevertheless, as Barbagli points out, "Intellectual unemployment and illiteracy are no less than two faces of the same coin: the condition of education in an underdeveloped country" (p. 92), and for this reason, if no other, this is an important book for students of national development and comparative education.

*College Choice in America.* By Charles F. Manski and David A. Wise. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983. Pp. 221. \$20.00.

Robert D. Mare  
*University of Wisconsin—Madison*

Many critical issues in educational stratification are hard to resolve because their investigation requires infeasible comparisons. Do schools enhance productivity or merely rank individuals? Does academic tracking reinforce or compensate for inequalities? Does the SAT screen out individuals for whom college is undesirable or arbitrarily limit educational opportunities? Are private schools more effective than public schools? Such questions turn on hypothetical comparisons of individuals' fates if they have one educational experience (e.g., a nonacademic high school track) with their fates if they had a different experience (an academic track). Since people never make exactly the same educational decision twice, investigators must interpret data on the different educational experiences of different individuals. Such data by themselves cannot resolve